

Peer Review Report

Review Report on Divergence and convergence of leadership competency frameworks in undergraduate medical education-scoping review.

Review, Public Health Rev

Reviewer: Florian Liberatore

Submitted on: 07 Mar 2023

Article DOI: 10.3389/phrs.2023.1605806

EVALUATION

Q 1 Please summarize the main theme of the review.

The scoping review compares leadership competency frameworks in Undergraduate Medical Education against the public health leadership competency framework with respect to content, framework development including considering the frameworks in English, Spanish, and Portuguese.

Q 2 Please highlight the limitations and strengths.

Strengths: Review of existing studies including publications of multiple languages. Fokus on framework development and framework domains. Proper review development according to guidelines.

Limitations: Poor justification of relevance of the review content as well as the usage of the public health leadership competency framework as "standard". The results about the domains are not contextualized to the major challenges of healthcare systems and health professionals worldwide.

Consequently, the review does not connect to major research fields in health services research and healthcare management research.

Q 3 Please provide your detailed review report to the authors, structured in major and minor comments.

Major comments:

General: The authors should clearly define if the review has a major focus on Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC) regions or claims providing a worldwide view on the topic.

Introduction: The importance of leadership education in undergraduate medical education is poorly described. Further, the classification of the public health leadership competency framework as "standard" needs a proper justification.

Methods: I would recommend omitting the public health leadership competency framework as standard. Instead I would suggest comparing the identified frameworks against the major challenges that need leadership competency.

Discussion: This sections needs improvements related to structure, contextualization to existing research fields and health system related challenges.

Minor Comments: It could be interesting analyzing the frameworks with respect to healthcare system-related differences. Especially because the authors stress that they have a special focus on Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC) regions, region or country-specific differences could be of interest.

PLEASE COMMENT

Q 4 Does the reference list cover the relevant literature adequately and in an unbiased manner?

The search strategy as well as the final reference list appears adequate for me.

Q 5 Does this manuscript refer only to published data? (unpublished data is not allowed for Reviews)

Yes.

Q 6 Does the manuscript cover the issue in an objective and analytical manner

Yes.

Q 7 Was a review on the issue published in the past 12 months?

No.

Q 8 Does the review have international or global implications?

The review considers frameworks in undergraduate medical education (UME) in English, Spanish, and Portuguese. However, the review fails connecting the relevance of leadership education with the major challenges of the health systems worldwide such as nursing shortage which is partly caused by poor leadership/management.

Q 9 Is the title appropriate, concise, attractive?

The title is misleading because the comparison against the public health leadership competency framework is not mentioned.

Q 10 Are the keywords appropriate?

System thinking does not fit in the list of keywords

Q 11 Is the English language of sufficient quality?

The logical structure needs improvement. Some sentences are of poor language quality. Some words have typos.

Q 12 Is the quality of the figures and tables satisfactory?

Yes.

QUALITY ASSESSMENT

Q 13 Quality of generalization and summary



Q 14 Significance to the field

Q 15 Interest to a general audience

Q 16 Quality of the writing

REVISION LEVEL

Q 17 Please take a decision based on your comments:

Major revisions.